

E.6. 4-9-96

JONES, DAY, REAVIS & POGUE

ATLANTA LOS ANGELES BRUSSELS NEW DELHI CHICAGO NEW YORK COLUMBUS PARIS DALLAS PITTSBURGH FRANKFURT RIYADH GENEVA HONG KONG TAIPEI TOKYO IRVINE

LONDON

NORTH POINT

901 LAKESIDE AVENUE

CLEVELAND, OHIO 44114

TELEPHONE: 216-586-3939
TELEX: 980389
CABLE: ATTORNEYS CLEVELAND
FACSIMILE: 216-579-0212
WRITER'S DIRECT NUMBER:

(216) 586-7155

April 9, 1996

189809_1 950627-001-001 0469:PJL

WASHINGTON

Sherry L. Estes, Esq.
United States Environmental Protection Agency (CS-29A)
Region 5
77 West Jackson Boulevard
Chicago, IL 60604-3590

Re: Stickney Avenue Landfill

Dear Ms. Estes:

I am writing on behalf of Alside, Inc. to request that Alside be removed from the list of entities which the U.S. EPA considers to be potentially responsible parties with respect to the Stickney Avenue Landfill in Toledo, Ohio. Alside makes this request because, to the best of Alside's knowledge, the Agency has no evidence that Alside arranged for the management or disposal of any hazardous substance at or on the properties currently referred to as the Stickney Avenue Landfill Site or the XXChem Company Site.

During a telephone conversation earlier this year, you informed me that the Agency's theory of Alside's liability is not premised on a claim that Alside sent material to the Stickney Avenue Landfill Site. Rather, you stated that Alside was considered a PRP because of materials it sent to a company known as S.M. Allen Inc. You explained to me that S.M. Allen had conducted business on a portion of the XXChem Company Site which is to be included within the scope of the response action to be taken at the adjacent Stickney Avenue Landfill Site.

While Alside disputes whether such a nexus between it and a company which conducted operations adjacent to a Superfund site to be addressed via response action renders it a PRP with respect to such a site, that is not the basis for Alside's request. Rather, Alside disputes that it sent any materials to S.M. Allen. Alside is aware of only two existing documents which reflect a single transaction between it and S.M. Allen. The first document, bearing Invoice No. 1050, was voided and subsequently replaced by the second document, Invoice No. 1051 dated December 22, 1981. Alside

Sherry Estes, Esq. April 9, 1996 Page 2

believes that this document reflects the purchase of 1,1,1 trichloroethane from S.M. Allen rather than a shipment.

For example, S.M. Allen Invoice No. 1011 relates to a July 16, 1981 transaction with Zeller Corporation. This invoice clearly covers the purchase by Zeller of virgin 1,1,1 trichloroethane at 36 cents per pound with another entry for recycled 1,1,1 trichloroethane at 25 cents per pound and a "sludge charge" of 35 cents per gallon. Other invoices showing transactions involving "refined" 1,1,1 trichloroethane show associated sludge charges as well. The absence of a sludge charge on the Alside invoice and the closer price between the Alside material and the virgin Zeller material demonstrates that the Alside invoice covers a purchase of virgin solvent from S.M. Allen rather than a charge for managing or disposing of spent solvent from Alside at the S.M. Allen facility.

Of course, there is no Superfund liability created simply because an entity purchases a hazardous substance from a facility at which later there is a release. This conclusion is clear through an examination of the document itself and in comparison with other S.M. Allen invoices covering both virgin solvent sales and recycling activities. Thus, if the only evidence tying Alside to S.M. Allen is a record of a purchase from the company rather than a shipment to the site, there is no reason to continue to consider Alside as a PRP. If there is other evidence of liability, the EPA should advise Alside of such evidence as soon as possible.

For your convenience, I have enclosed copies of the invoices mentioned in this letter. Please call me after you have had an opportunity to discuss the foregoing information.

Thank you for your attention to the important matter.

Very truly yours,

Stephen Q. Hibe_ Stephen Q. Giblin

Enclosures

age 3		\$. A 3903 TOLE
	The state of the s	(4
то	Zell	er Cor

Stictistes Avenue DO, OHIO 43608

119) 726-7810

poration

P 0 Box 278

Derlance, Chio 43512

· - ·				
		- n		
11 18/2 11 /		. 11	. لىت	
	スフス: 生でできなし	1 4		1
		· 🗀 * ·		
				10.5
• • •	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		a tong (Page)	~ · . ·

Nº 1011-

NVOICE DA	7-16-61	SALESPENON .
0 ₽ TO	Plant 1	
	Rt. 424 West	

our order no. 13 30338	DATE SHIPPE		SHIPPED VIA	F.O.B. POIN	n .er.ce	TERMS	. 50 Day	;;2 ;:2	
QUANTITY.	.,, .,, .,,	Name of the same	DESCRIPTIO) 	et was made was better beginning in	UNIT	PRICE	TOTA	. د جا
5757•4	Lbs	Recy	cled 1-1-1 Trichlor	rethane			•25,	\$ 1439	35
162.6	Грв	Virg	in 1-1-1 Trichlore	ibane			•36	58_	54
105	Gal	Slud	ge Cherge	e management, a man faste soom samp et spor, en jam ap skylve	······································		••35	3 - 35	75
			$i \cdot I_{i}$)		•		\$ 1534	5
			00 6/10/8	177	38				
د پ		•	() 8 ()	# ,	·			. •	
			Chick						g.
		•		•				- 2	
•		4 · p · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				•			

QUADRUPLICATE

Thank You

SMA0795

	5	S. M. ALLEN II 3903 Stehny Av TOLEDO, OND 43	175.40	<u>`</u>				
то	Alside	(419) 726-781	. ·	٦ <u>٦</u>	w	Mode DATE	Nº. 81.	1.15.53
	P O Box		<i>s</i> .	コンレイ	5 4			7.5
	A2705, 0	into 44309		5017	'= (
	•••					\$		1628
יבכר	-10407 -NTITY	12-21-81		Mer Bet	Tole	ور الله الا المستورة المادات ا	Het 30 I	
···	2	592# Drum	1-1-1 Tr	charethe		<u> </u>	344	\$
persona an operation of			- _	V ziv	1 -			
······································			Alle		城 众	CON		<u>- . </u>
		,	3	1.50		18	11	
٠.٠			Chi	<u></u>			F	
**************************************		4 -	· · · · · · ·		₹ 5		-	
			• • •					
UAC	RUPLIC	CATE	Ó.	Thank	You.		A market and a state of the	

	S. MALLEN 3903 Stickney TOLEDO, OHD				⊃ [Nº		
•	(419) 728-71	B10	MVOICE DATE	12-22-81	Pa	rthe	
Alaid	e Inc		8-₽ TO :	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	 		2
POB	ox 5010	The state of the s		**************************************		10 W/V	4
Aleron	,omo 44309				or in , , , , ,		
				,	,	1:	
10407	12-21-81	Branch Mtr Fgt	POINT Toledo	Terms Net	→ - 30 Da	ys	e state
ANTITY	1.	DESCRIPTION					DTAL.
A <u>NTITY</u>		1-1-1 Trichlorethene			PRICE.	· Luces TO	509 1
					PRICE	· Luces TO	1.
					PRICE	· Luces TO	- 1-
				UNITE	43#	· Luces TO	1.
2				UNITE	43#	· Luces TO	1.
2				UNITE	43#	· Luces TO	1.
2				UNITE	43#	· Luces TO	1.
2		1-1-1 Trichlorethans		UNITE	43#	· Luces TO	1.